

Chairman Scott Cole called the October 2, 2017 meeting of the Town of Claverack Planning Board to order at 7:00 p.m.

Members in attendance were: Chairman Scott Cole, Jock Winch, Virginia Ambrose, Robert Vecchi, William Michael, Stephen King, attorney; Rob Fitzsimmons, engineer; George Schmitt and secretary; Jodi Keyser.

Absent with regrets: Gretchen Stearns

Board members reviewed the minutes of the September 11, 2017 meeting.

Motion to approve the September 11, 2017 minutes was made by Stephen King with a second from Robert Vecchi. All members were in favor. Motion carried.

CONTINUING APPLICATIONS FOR 10/2/17:

Schram, Peter & Nicholas Subdivision: Tax Map #(SBL) 131 . 00 – 01 – 11 Located at 24 & 36 Van Wyck Lane. Boundary Line Adjustment adding 2 acres from 36 Van Wyck Lane to 24 Van Wyck Lane.

Peter and Nicholas Schram were present for the application. Peter Schram informed the Board that he recently purchased 24 Van Wyck Lane and his son currently owns 36 Van Wyck Lane which have a common boundary line. Peter Schram continued that he recently sold 24 Van Wyck Lane and before the sale was finalized he wanted to subdivide approximately 2 acres from the 24 Van Wyck Lane property and gift it to his son adding to his property for privacy. Mr. Schram informed the Board that this had taken several months to accomplish because he was unaware that the properties were in the 5 acre zone therefore he needed to seek an Area Variance from the TOC ZBA. Mr. Schram informed the Board that he was granted an Area Variance and is now here to finalize the subdivision. Mr. Schram informed the Board that the new owners have agreed to the subdivision and it was written into the new deeds. Rob Fitzsimmons stated that Mr. Schram had been granted an Area Variance from the TOC ZBA for the subdivision because the parcels were non-conforming pre-existing sizes and are directly adjacent to the one acre zone and would not have a negative impact on the neighborhood. Chairman Cole opened the meeting to the public hearing at 7:04 p.m. No comments. Chairman Cole closed the public hearing at 7:05 p.m. George Schmitt reviewed the SEQRA for the Board members.

Motion to grant a negative declaration for purposes of SEQRA was made by Jock Winch with second from Virginia Ambrose. All members were in favor. Motion carried.

Motion to approve the Boundary Line Adjustment was made by Stephen King with a second from William Michael. All members were in favor. Motion carried. Maps were stamped and signed. Mr. Schram paid final fees of \$300.00.

Fieldmakers Site Plan Review & Special Exception: Tax Map #(SBL) 130 . – 1 – 6 . 112 Located at 195 Stone Mill Rd. Site Plan Review for the development of a new agro-tourism farm project including a farm with support buildings, guest cabins, event space and a caretaker/owner dwelling.

Victoria Masters and David Crawford of Crawford and Associates were present for the application. Mr. Crawford apologized to the Board for the numerous changes with engineers working on the project. Mr. Crawford stated that the Planning Board has continued the public hearing and his goal tonight is to finalize the public hearing, receive SEQRA and final approval of the Site Plan. Mr. Crawford informed the Board that he has responded to the comment letter from George Schmitt and has all of the requested documentation. Chairman Scott Cole informed Mr. Crawford that the TOC engineer George Schmitt had some concerns. Rob Fitzsimmons stated that there were some technical issues that were noted and updates were made to the Site Plan and there were also major public comments. Mr. Crawford referred to Page 4 of the Site Plan which contains the Stormwater plan and expects further comments from George Schmitt. Rob Fitzsimmons informed the Board and the audience that the Planning Board members along with George Schmitt made a site visit to the proposed site. Mr. Crawford informed the Board that a traffic study has shown that the project will not impact the road and that traffic speed is not something that the project can mitigate only enforcement of the speed

limits by the police can help this. Stephen King stated that speeding was a concern but not the main concern which is the increased traffic. Stephen King asked how to read the traffic report. Ryan Young stated that they used a trip generating manual and broke the number of cars down by uses such as homes, farm, single family residences, farm education, etc. Ryan Young continued that the study found that the relative trips for the typical uses were 3.1 and they also found that this totaled between 2% and 3% increase of traffic on NYS Routes 9-H & 23. Ryan Young stated that they did not have specific traffic data for Stone Mill Road. Stephen King stated that the public needs to see less than a 3% increase in traffic and the submitted information are only a guess and not solid evidence. Mr. Crawford stated that this project will not impact the traffic because the guests will only make a trip to the site and then stay, they will not come and go. Robert Vecchi asked if people can stay without leaving and if the cabins will be equipped with kitchens. Ms. Masters stated that people will stay onsite and no leave and the cabins will have small kitchens for cooking. Robert Vecchi asked if the guests are required to participate in the farming operations during their stay. Ms. Masters answered no guests are not required to participate but are encouraged. Robert Vecchi asked if the guests did not want to participate could they just sit around all day. Ms. Masters answered yes or they could leave the farm to visit Hudson or the area. Mr. Crawford informed the Board that noise will not be an issue because the cabins are set well into the site in the woods. Stephen King informed the applicant that just because the cabins are at the rear of the property the noise could be an issue with neighboring property owners that border the site in the back. Mr. Crawford informed the Board that the site will contain dark sky compliant downward facing lighting that will mitigate the light spillage and they will maintain the tree line along Stone Mill Rd. to help also. Mr. Crawford informed the Board that the wetlands have been delineated. Jock Winch stated that during the visit the Planning Board members looked at every delineated wetland area along with the ACOE wetland maps. Mr. Crawford informed the Board members that he has spoken to the A. B. Shaw Fire Chief regarding the plan and that the Chief has no concerns. Mr. Crawford continued that they are currently awaiting a curb cut from the Columbia County Highway Department. Mr. Crawford stated that they are also awaiting a SPEDEs permit but it requires the TOC Planning Board approval. Mr. Crawford continued that a cultural resource study will be completed and sent to SHIPO. Mr. Crawford stated that the project will utilize the TOC Water district and have contacted the Town of Greenport Water Department which will have little impact. William Michael asked for clarification that guests do not have to participate in the farming operation. Ms. Masters stated that is correct and she cannot make people participate. William Michael stated that the guests could do whatever they want. Ms. Masters stated that the guests could observe or harvest vegetables or not do anything at all but she feels that people coming to stay would want to because they would want to participate. Jock Winch stated that he felt that it is like going to a dude ranch and you could ride horses or not ride horses but it is up to the guest to decide when they purchase a package. Ms. Masters stated that it is an al-la-carte type of stay. Jock Winch stated that he is sure that the marketing will advertise this as a modern farm stay in a cabin which will clearly indicate what happens at the stay. Stephen King stated that it could be marketed like a bed & breakfast on a farm and not just a sleep for cheap. Ms. Masters stated that she is promoting the site as a modern farm stay and guests can participate by self-guided farm stand visits and buying and preparing food in the cabins. ? Stated that Kinderhook has a farm stay that is booked 2 years out. Ms. Masters informed the Board that there are no other farm stay operations of these scale mostly old farms with bed & breakfast types of stays. Ms. Masters stated that the acreage on the side will house the animals, chickens and goats that would be housed within a modular fencing system that can easily be moved so that the animals are rotated on the space. Ms. Masters stated that the bee hives are not shown because they could be placed anywhere on the site. Ms. Masters informed the Board that they have started tilling the area and preparing for planting in the spring. Ms. Masters continued that she is working with Dan McManus to plan the fields and separate farm areas. Virginia Ambrose asked how many farmers does she expect to have working. Ms. Masters stated that she would anticipate several different farmers that would grow different crops like herbs, flowers, vegetables, mushrooms and animal care. Virginia Ambrose asked what size part of the farm will each one use. Ms. Masters stated that approximately ½ acre each but bees will not use that they will be throughout the site. Virginia Ambrose stated that she does not see any enclosed barn for the goats and chickens. Ms. Masters stated that the animals will be held in portable fencing pens. Virginia Ambrose asked if the cabins will be open for rent in the winter. Ms. Ambrose answered yes open four seasons and guests will learn the different aspects of each season i.e. greenhouse, prepping, planting, seed germination, livestock, etc. Virginia Ambrose asked what will the goat milk be used for. Ms. Masters answered to make soap. Chairman Cole asked what will happen with the chicken waste. Ms. Masters answered that she will use the manure for the gardens. Chairman Cole stated that chicken manure can smell very bad. Jock Winch asked how many chickens

will be on site. Ms. Masters answered 30 to 50 chickens and the chicken waste will be removed each day and spread and they will also use a chicken tractor which moves the chickens so waste will not build up. Chairman Cole stated that the smell can be pungent. Virginia Ambrose asked if there will be cows and horses. Ms. Masters answered no because they require intense care. Chairman Cole continued the public hearing and addressed the audience to keep their comments to keep it flowing.

Brian Gaylord stated that if the traffic study showed an increase of 3% on NYS Rtes. 9-H & 23 which are major highways then 3% is a major impact on Stone Mill Rd. which is a small residential road. Brian Gaylord continued that he feels that the impact will be much higher than 3%. Mr. Crawford stated that they do not have specific numbers. Brian Gaylord continued that the traffic on Stone Mill Rd. has increased greatly with the closure of Webb Rd. and the impact will be more like 20% to 30%. Brian Gaylord stated that the fire company was only contacted regarding hydrants not the project itself or concerns with emergency response. Mr. Crawford stated that he has a letter from the A. B. Shaw Fire Chief. Brian Gaylord asked if he wanted to just call up and stay in the cabins and not participate in the farm he could. Ms. Masters stated yes guests can just rent the cabins and not participate. Brian Gaylord asked what happens to the project if the idea is not successful will it be finished or be like the farm on NYS Rte. 23-B that is falling apart and looks like a dump. Mr. Crawford stated that the project will be built in phases so the second and third phases will not be started without the success of the first phase.

Andrew ? stated that the TOC Comprehensive plan reads like this is the perfect for the site. ? continued that what is the future of farming and farmland is disappearing. ? continued that this is the future of farming and refurbishing an old farm into a new farm and build infrastructure is inspiring and is a much better idea then a large subdivision with several homes.

Andy Taggard stated that this is more like gardening then farming. Victoria Masters stated that this is considered micro-gardens. Mr. Taggard asked how money will be generated into the TOC budget for fire, emergency services, road maintenance, and etc. will this be funded through grants and will taxes be exempt. Ms. Masters stated that she is in the process of submitting her plan to Ag & Markets. Andy Taggard stated that in his opinion this is not a farm but only gardening and he doesn't buy the 2% traffic increase on Stone Mill Road. Rob Fitzsimmons informed the Board and audience that the TOC Zoning Laws allows for agro-tourism this plan fits the definitions and these such uses can be on as little as an acre of property as with a farm in Claverack growing hops for beer making.

Michael Tavano asked if the site will have their own security staff on site. Ms. Masters stated that staff will be on site but not a security guard. Mr. Tavano continued that with all of the people he would think that security of some kind would be required. Mr. Tavano stated that the project is not a farm in his opinion and the idea of agro-tourism started from wanting to help struggling family farms create new ways to use their farms to increase their incomes. Mr. Tavano asked how many Special Exceptions are being considered for this project because it seems like several. Rob Fitzsimmons stated that agro-tourism is a use so anything allowed under agro-tourism is all under the one use. Mr. Tavano asked if all of the different things i.e. animals, gardens, houses, cabins, events are all considered as one use. Rob Fitzsimmons answered yes allowed under one use but the Planning Board will review the issues such as parking, lighting, hours of operation which will be determined during the Special Exception Review.

Tom Bartels is concerned about the increase in traffic on Stone Mill Rd. because in his opinion the increase will be more like 6% going to the project. Mr. Crawford stated that he will submit a written response regarding traffic. Mr. Bartels stated that adding 3.1 trips per house does not take into consideration the number of farmers that will visit the site daily, the number of maintenance people that will make a trip each day, number of employees that will travel to the site and the number of outside people that will visit for educational classes. Mr. Crawford stated that he will respond to the traffic report in writing. Rob Fitzsimmons suggested that the traffic report should be broken down to show the average of everything on site. Mr. Bartels stated that he is surprised that 17 acres will sustain a farm stand. Ms. Masters stated that farmers and others will also bring goods to the farm stand to sell from off-site. Ms. Masters stated that the farm stand will not only sell items from the site. Mr. Bartels wished the owners the best of luck but stated that he is skeptical. Mr. Bartels continued that the tax breaks vs benefits and the cabins will bring money not through farming and will hurt local tax payers. Mr. Bartels stated that this seems like a glorified bed & breakfast.

Ms. Masters stated that the cabins will be secluded in the woods and the soils are not the best but they will enhance them for planting. Ms. Masters stated that this is not a bed & breakfast or an Air B&B but is different because guests will be immersed in a working farm and the farmers will be very involved. Mr. Bartels asked Ms. Masters if she has farmers on board. Ms. Masters stated that she is in the process of prepping the land before showing interested farmers. Mr. Bartels

stated to Ms. Masters that she will become a member of a community in a small area which is already under stress from the Brookwood facility and she should be mindful of ways to make the community better. Ms. Masters stated that the 50 acre parcel is being preserved into beautiful farmlands with natural tree lines and the cabins will not be visible and her doors are always open to the community, schools and camps. Mr. Bartels asked why she purchased this property with all of the land for sale. Ms. Masters stated that she fell in love with the property.

Roger Cumar informed the Board that one of the farmers that will be working with Ms. Masters has worked with him and is very experienced. Mr. Cumar continued that this type of farm is much needed and is biodynamic which enriches the area. Mr. Cumar stated that security will not be a concern because the guests will not be here to cause trouble and he knows of 20 bed hotels in Hudson that do not have a security guard. Mr. Tavano stated that the project is not in Hudson. Mr. Cumar stated that security will not be needed and he would hope that the community would welcome this and would want their children to experience farming through fieldmakers. Mr. Cumar suggested that the neighbors help Ms. Masters instead of trying to stop the project.

Mr. Tavano asked the Planning Board if the plan changes and more cabins are wanted or the house changes what happens. Chairman Cole stated that if the plan changes the applicant is required to reappear before the Planning Board for further review.

Linda Daley informed the Board that she is concerned with an increase in crime that might happen with approximately 200 transient guests per month walking, driving and staying at the site. Ms. Daley continued that the neighbors leave their homes now knowing that their belongings will be safe. Ms. Daley continued that the property values on Stone Mill Road will decrease and can see problems.

Walter Jutkofsky asked if agro-tourism is agriculture supporting tourism or tourism supporting agriculture. Ms. Masters stated both. Mr. Jutkofsky asked the % of funding that is coming from grants. Ms. Masters stated that she is in the process of sourcing funding now and she may apply for grants. Mr. Jutkofsky stated that he cannot see the economic advantage of the project as an agricultural use because the majority of the money to support the project will be gained from the rent of the cabins not the small gardens. Chairman Cole informed the audience that the Planning Board is not allowed to ask the applicants to produce financial plan. Rob Fitzsimmons stated that whether this is a farming operation or other business the Planning Board cannot get into how the applicant plans to finance the project. Mr. Jutkofsky asked what happens if the project fails what will happen with the roads and infrastructure. Mr. Jutkofsky stated that the applicant can then do anything they want. Chairman Cole stated that not every applicant is granted an approval.

Jack Konderwich stated that he is concerned with the lighting. Mr. Crawford informed the Board that the plan will have dark sky compliant downward facing lighting fixtures with no outside spillage of light. Chairman Cole asked if the lights will be mounted on poles or ground mounts. Mr. Crawford stated that each cabin will have a light at the door and the farm stand and farm center will both have internal lighting. Chairman Cole informed the applicant that the lights are a concern because the area is already flooded with lights from the Brookwood Center. George Schmitt informed the Board that the Brookwood Center does not have dark sky compliant lighting because it is a security facility. George Schmitt informed the Board that the Site Plan does not show lighting poles so therefore they are not using lights mounted on poles and if this changes then the applicant will be required to return for continued review.

Diane Konderwich stated that Stone Mill Rd. is a residential roadway and she has no problems with farming on the road but she is concerned with the idea that people will be coming to rent cabins. Diane Konderwich stated to the Board that this is a big issue for Stone Mill Rd. because it will change the character of the neighborhood. Ms. Konderwich continued that everyone from the neighborhood is at the meeting which indicates how important it is.

John Staib stated that he is concerned with the numbers of people coming and going from the site.

Heather Grimes stated that this is a great idea and is happy to see another farm come into the county and to have a place to go to learn the aspects of farming.

Tom Holmes stated that he was under the impression that agro-tourism was created to help established existing farming operations to find other ways to use their farms to be profitable not to start a new farm. Rob Fitzsimmons stated that agro-tourism doesn't mean helping just existing farms but it includes start up farms also. Tom Holmes informed the Board that he is the third generation of farmer on his land and his 18 year old son will be the 4th generation to run the farm. Mr. Holmes continued that this is a great vision but the impact on the small parcel will be too much for the site to accommodate. Mr. Holmes continued that the neighborhood will be impacted because of increased traffic so he suggested that the Planning Board members be careful and considerate of the area before they approve the project. Rob Fitzsimmons stated that this is why the Planning Board has continued the public hearing to be able to have an extensive review. Rob Fitzsimmons stated that the issues for the applicant to clear up are SHIPPO, highway curb cuts, additional traffic review

information for Stone Mill Road. Stephen King stated that the amount of traffic is an issue because the Board or the applicants are not responsible for the speeding. Robert Vecchi asked what types of activities will the guests have available during the evening hours. Ms. Masters stated that the guests will be sleeping. Ms. Masters stated that a few times a year she plans to hold a farm to table event where invited guests will be able to have a chef prepare different meals from locally sourced products. Robert Vecchi asked if any other structured events will be available for the guests. Ms. Masters answered no they will be free to do what they want. Robert Vecchi stated the guests will be able to sit around and drink beer to occupy the down time. Stephen King stated that the Planning Board cannot tell the applicant how to run her business. Robert Vecchi stated that he is not trying to tell how to run the business but it is the Planning Board's duty to make sure that the business is run safely and that the community surrounding the business is safe. Ms. Masters stated that the cabins will not be air conditioned so most of the guests will sit outside, take walks, and go into the neighboring towns for recreation. Chairman Cole informed the applicant that the Planning Board has received several letters from the neighbors with their concerns.

Jock Winch stated that his father was a small business owner in the TOC for several years and his grandfather before that and he knows most of the people here because he grew up with them. Mr. Winch continued that the entire time he was growing up he wanted to move as far away from Claverack as he could and now he sees what a great town it is. Mr. Winch continued that he left for a short time and decided to return to the area and started a small carpentry business. Mr. Winch continued that he wants to see the town grow and wants to see small businesses come into the town to help the economy. Jock Winch stated that the community should be more favorable of the project and should be helping the applicant instead of finding so many reasons to be against the plan. Jock Winch continued that the project is a great idea and would be a big benefit to the community. Jock Winch continued that the economic advantage of the project is much better than subdividing the property and having several houses or even just only one big house. Mr. Winch asked the audience to try to be constructive.

Chairman Cole continued the public hearing for the November 6, 2017 meeting. Rob Fitzsimmons suggested that the applicant make electronic submissions of future materials to expedite them to the Board members to review prior to the November meeting.

ACW Millworking Co. Site Plan & Special Exception Permit Review: Tax Map #(SBL) 101 . 00 – 02 – 49. Located in the Columbia County Commerce Park Lot #3. Site Plan and Special Exception Permit Review for the construction of a 9,600 square foot building for the purposes of a millwork manufacturing facility with office space.

MacKenzie Calhoun, Josh Wainschaf and Andy Didio were present for the application. Mr. Didio submitted new Site Plans for the application. Mr. Didio explained the Site Plan changes with the change to the shoulder of the entrance and full length loading dock which will not add to the overall square footage. Mr. Didio continued that the density table was changed from 35% to 39% but is still well under the allowed 75%. Mr. Didio informed the Board that he added more plantings in an irregular pattern with some low shrubbery around the sign. Mr. Didio added that a stockade fence will be added around the dumpsters. Stephen King asked where the door for the loading dock is located. Mr. Didio answered that the door might not be seen because of the sheet metal screen. Virginia Ambrose asked if the loading dock is for one truck at a time. Mr. Didio answered yes. Robert Vecchi asked if the loading dock is below grade. Mr. Didio answered it is like a ½ dock that will be 2 ½ feet grade. Chairman Cole asked if the Board members had any questions. No further Board questions. Chairman Cole opened the meeting to the public hearing at 8:45 p.m. No comments. Public hearing closed at 8:45 p.m. George Schmitt reviewed the SEQRA for the Board.

Motion to grant a negative declaration for purposes of SEQRA was made by Robert Vecchi with a second from William Michael. All members were in favor. Motion carried.

Motion to approve the Site Plan and Special Exception Permit was made by Virginia Ambrose with a second from Stephen King. All members were in favor. Motion carried.

Applicants paid mailing fee of \$4.80. Site Plan maps were stamped and signed.

NEW APPLICATIONS FOR 10/2/17:

Tracy Martin Site Plan:

Tracy Martin was present at the meeting for a previously approved Site Plan at 261 Schoolhouse Rd. Ms. Martin informed the Board that she received a ZBA approval to renovate an existing barn to use as a guest

house. Rob Fitzsimmons informed the Board that Ms. Martin and her husbands appeared in 2015 before the TOC ZBA and were granted an Area Variance because the renovation of the barn is larger than the allowed size for a guest house because the barn is larger than the main house. Ms. Martin continued that while starting the renovation on the barn they needed to raise the barn to repair and replace the foundation. Ms. Martin stated that while the barn was raised they decided to turn the barn 90°. Ms. Martin stated that she wished that this was planned with the previous approval but they just decided when the barn was raised. Ms. Martin informed the Board that this would make more sense and will make the barn further from the creek. Virginia Ambrose stated that this is a good idea.

Motion to accept the minor change in the previously approved Site Plan to turn the existing barn 90 degrees was made by Virginia Ambrose with a second from Robert Vecchi. All members were in favor. Motion carried.

NEW BUSINESS:

Rob Fitzsimmons informed the Board that he has been in contact with the new owners of the Pine Haven Nursing facility regarding a Boundary Line Adjustment. Rob Fitzsimmons continued that the new owners are seeking HUD financing to renovate the facility and need to move the boundary line between the old building and the newer portion of the building. Rob Fitzsimmons informed the Board that they will need an Area Variance from the TOC ZBA and a Boundary Line Adjustment from the TOC Planning Board. Rob Fitzsimmons continued that the owners are anxious and will be submitting the required applications in the near future.

Stephen King commended Chairman Cole for handling the public hearing for the Fieldmakers application. Chairman Cole stated that this will create a major traffic issue in his opinion and will be a tough decision.

Motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Robert Vecchi with a second from Jock Winch. All members were in favor. Motion carried. Meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jodi Keyser, Secretary